

MCMOM/06/22-23

31/05/2022

Minutes of the Managing Committee Meeting of Empire Kismet CHS Ltd.

The Managing Committee of Empire Kismet Cooperative Housing Society Ltd. was called by the Hon. Secretary, Mr. Nanu Rohit as per notice No. Notice/06/22-23 dated 26/05/2022. The meeting was held in hybrid mode (Offline as well as Online). The offline venue was the residence of the Hon. Secretary, Mr. Nanu Rohit, 14, Kismet, 48 Carter Road, Bandra West, Mumbai 400 050. The meeting was held on 31/05/2022 at 05:30 pm.

The following members were present at the meeting.

Sr. No.	Name of the Member	Flat No.	Attendance Mode
1	Mr. Goenka Arun	20	Offline
2	Mr. Rohit Nanu	14	Offline
3	Mr. Janardan Mahesh	19	Offline
4	Mr. Gonsalves Godwin	2	Offline
5	Mrs. Shaikh Jamila	1	<u>Online</u>
6	Mrs. Baig Moina	23	Offline
7	Mr. Mankar Rohit	21	<u>Online</u>
8	Mr. Khemani Shyam	10	<u>Online</u>

The following were special invitees to this Managing Committee Meeting on the Redevelopment process:

1. Mr. Nitin Tabhane – K.K.Ramani & Associates.
2. Mr. Ronak Mehta – Palash PMC LLP. Mr. Mehta attended the meeting online.

The meeting was chaired by Mr. Arun Goenka, the Chairman of the Society.

Before commencing the formal meeting, the Chairman thanked Mr. Nitin Tabhane, representing K.K.Ramani & Associates, the legal advisors of the Society for the Redevelopment Process and Mr. Ronak Mehta, Partner at Palash PMC LLP, the Project Management Consultant of the Society for taking time out of their busy schedule and being present.

Mr. Arun Goenka requested Mr. Nanu Rohit - Hon. Secretary to begin the meeting as per the Agenda.

Agenda Point No. 1:

To read and confirm minutes of the previous committee meeting dated 14th May 2022 and 25th May 2022:

The Hon. Secretary read the minutes of the Managing Committee Meeting held on 14th May 2022 & 25th May 2022 and the following resolution was passed:

Resolution of Agenda Point No. 1:

RESOLVED that the minutes of the Managing Committee Meeting held on 14/05/2022 be accepted and confirmed.

Proposed by: Mrs. Jamila Shaikh
Seconded by: Mr. Godwin Gonsalves
Passed: Unanimously.

FURTHER RESOLVED that the minutes of the Managing Committee Meeting held on 25/05/2022 be accepted and confirmed.

Proposed by: Mr. Rohit Mankar
Seconded by: Mrs. Moina Baig
Passed: Unanimously.

Agenda Point No. 2:

To discuss and approve the comparison chart as submitted by the Society's PMC, M/s. Palash PMC LLP.

The Chairman informed all the members that the Comparison Chart prepared by the Society's PMC was circulated to all and invited queries on the same. The members opined that the chart was comprehensive and had covered all relevant points. Accordingly the following resolution was passed:

Resolution of Agenda Point No. 2:

RESOLVED that the Comparison Chart prepared by the Society's PMC, M/s. Palash PMC LLP be accepted and taken on record.

Proposed by: Mr. Rohit Mankar
Seconded by: Mr. Mahesh Janardan
Passed: Unanimously.

Agenda Point No. 3:

To shortlist the tenders received as per guidelines of section 79A with the help of the Project Management Consultant, by applying such diverse criteria as their experience, merit, financial capacity, technical competence, competitive rates etc.

The Chairman invited Mr. Mehta to speak on the subject. Mr. Mehta informed the members that his office had prepared a comprehensive comparison chart and this could be used as a tool along with other criteria to shortlist the developers amongst the tenders received.

He first requested the members to decide on the number of developers to be shortlisted. His suggestion was to initially shortlist five (05) developers and thereafter bring it down to three (03).

The Chairman and Treasurer were of the opinion that the Managing Committee should directly shortlist three developers instead of going through the motion five and then three. The Secretary felt that a wider selection should be done and that the Managing Committee should not start with a low number. Mrs. Baig concurred with him. Mr. Tabhane requested the members to vote on the matter and the tabulated results are as under:

Sr. No.	Name of the Member	No. of Developers to be shortlisted.
1	Mr. Goenka Arun	3
2	Mr. Rohit Nanu	5
3	Mr. Janardan Mahesh	3
4	Mr. Gonsalves Godwin	5
5	Mrs. Shaikh Jamila	5
6	Mrs. Baig Moina	5
7	Mr. Mankar Rohit	5
8	Mr. Khemani Shyam	5

Mr. Mahesh Janardan then requested the members to decide on the criteria for selection. He informed the member that the selection process should cover a diverse range of criteria and requested the members to outline their suggestions.

Mrs. Shaikh felt that developers offering area above 50% and their reputation should be one criterion for shortlisting.

Mr. Mankar was of the opinion that reputation and standing in the market along with work in hand should be considered.

Mr. Rohit & Mrs. Baig felt that additional area, corpus, shifting expense, parking being offered and reputation should be considered.

Mr. Gonsalves felt that area, construction cost and reputation and standing in the market are important for the shortlisting process.

Mr. Goenka opined that area was the most important criteria.

Mr. Khemani opined that area along with track record should be the criteria for selection.

Mr. Janardan felt that reputation is equally important as area and felt that the choice of builder shortlisted should not be left to one criterion alone.

Both Mr. Mehta and Mr. Tabhane informed the members that M/s. SDC Infrastructure Pvt. Ltd. had not met the tender criteria of minimum hardship allowance. Their recommendation was that this developer should not be considered but the ultimate decision was left to the members.

Mr. Mehta informed the members that most of the builders on the list have a good track record and reputation and all things being equal, area being offered becomes an important criterion for the selection. He further informed the members that further negotiations can be held with the shortlisted builders and there could be an improvement in the offers. Mr. Tabhane requested the members to vote for five (05) developers to arrive at the list of shortlisted builders. The abbreviated tabulated results are as under:

Mr. Nanu Rohit	TKL	JGB	WADHWA	K. RAHEJA	SSD
Mrs. Moina Baig	KEYSTONE	JGB	K. RAHEJA	WADHWA	CALVIN
Mr. Godwin Gonsalves	JGB	WADHWA	CALVIN	SSD	K. RAHEJA
Mr. Arun Goenka	JGB	WADHWA	K. RAHEJA	TKL	CALVIN
Mr. Rohit Mankar	TKL	JGB	WADHWA	K. RAHEJA	KEYSTONE
Mrs. Jamila Shaikh	JGB	TKL	CALVIN	KEYSTONE	S. RAHEJA
Mr. Shyam Khemani	JGB	WADHWA	K. RAHEJA	TKL	CALVIN
Mr. Mahesh Janardan	JGB	KEYSTONE	K. RAHEJA	WADHWA	CALVIN

Based on the above, the shortlisted five (05) Developers are as under:

1. JGB Builders LLP (Satguru).
2. Wadhwa Estates & Developers
3. K. Raheja Corp.
4. Calvin Group of Companies.
5. TKL Infra Developers Pvt. Ltd.

Mr. Mehta suggested that the Managing Committee should meet the shortlisted developers either online or offline and get clarifications on the points left open in their submitted tenders as outlined in the comparison chart. He further suggested that Managing Committee may invite the shortlisted Developers to make presentations to the members of the Society followed by a Question and Answer session. During such a presentation, the Society member can get all their queries directly clarified by the shortlisted Developers. The members welcomed this suggestion.

Resolution of Agenda Point No. 3:

RESOLVED that Five (05) Developers be shortlisted by the Managing Committee.

Proposed by: Mrs. Moina Baig

Seconded by: Mr. Godwin Gonsalves

Passed: By Majority of six members for and two members against.

FURTHER RESOLVED that the Five (05) Developers duly shortlisted by the Managing Committee be taken on record and the Managing Committee begin the process of the discussions with them followed by an invitation for making a presentation to the Society Members.

Proposed by: Mr. Rohit Mankar

Seconded by: Mrs. Jamila Shaikh

Passed: Unanimously.

Agenda Point No. 4:

To apply to the Dy. Registrar for the appointment of an Authorised Officer so that the future Special General Body Meeting for finalising the Developer / Builder can be held in the presence of the representative from the office of the Registrar of Co-operative Societies.

The Chairman requested the assistance of Mr. Tabhane in preparing the letter along with applicable enclosures to be submitted to the Dy. Registrar. Mr. Tabhane informed the members that his office will do the needful. Mr. Mehta informed the members that he will provide all assistance in preparing the file for submission to the Dy. Registrar.

Resolution of Agenda Point No. 4:

RESOLVED that the letter to the Dy. Registrar be submitted along with all applicable documents.

Proposed by: Mrs. Moina Baig

Seconded by: Mr. Godwin Gonsalves

Passed: Unanimously.

The Chairman once again thanked Mr. Tabhane and Mr. Mehta for sparing their valuable time and answering all the questions raised. The Chairman thanked Mr. Nanu Rohit for allowing his home to be used as the venue for this important Managing Committee Meeting.

The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to the Chair.

for **EMPIRE KISMET COOPERATIVE HOUSING SOCIETY LTD.**

(Regd.No.Bom/Hsg/2151 of 1969, Dated 19/08/1969)



MR. ARUN GOENKA
(CHAIRMAN)



MR. NANU ROHIT
(HON. SECRETARY)

Place: Mumbai

Date: 31/05/2022